

Effectiveness, Relevance, and Sustainability of Extension Projects: The Case of Bukidnon State University College of Education

Dr. Bernadette S. Binayao

Shaunell Mary J. Sayson

Dr. Lolita S. Dulay

Abstract:- The study determined the effectiveness, relevance, and sustainability of the extension projects of Bukidnon State University (BukSU) of the College of Education (CoE) during the years 2019-2020. The areas such as learning outcomes, delivery and instructional materials, resource persons/trainers, and venues and facilities were considered to assess the effectiveness of the projects. The relevance of the projects to BukSU Framework, national and international goals were also determined.

The descriptive quantitative method of research was utilized using the researcher-made survey instrument. The participants of the study were the 118 teacher beneficiaries of the projects. The statistical mean and standard deviation were used in the treatment of the data.

Generally, the findings revealed that the beneficiaries of the four extension projects under the CoE *strongly agreed* that the activities conducted were *highly effective* and *highly relevant*. Similarly, the sustainability of the projects was generally *highly sustainable* as *strongly agreed* by the beneficiaries under the three (3) projects namely *Capacitating DepEd Teachers on Knowledge and Skills in Sports; Capacitating the ALS InFed Teachers in Teaching Life-Skills Education; and Empowering Child Development Workers' Classroom Management*; however, for the project *Pedagogical Content Knowledge in Action*, it was *sustainable* as *agreed* by the beneficiaries.

Keywords:- Effectiveness, Relevance, Sustainability, CoE Extension Projects.

I. INTRODUCTION

Universities, colleges, and other higher education institutions (HEIs) in the Philippines play a critical role in facilitating social, environmental, and economic development. These institutions are also crucial in the achievement of the sustainable development goal agenda by means of the intensified university community engagement through extension activities. HEIs are specifically mentioned under Sustainable Development Goal 4 on equitable quality and inclusive education; in fact, their influence extends across all the goals through teaching and

learning, research output, and campus initiatives. HEIs are mandated to perform teaching, research, and extension (Aniedi & Effiom, 2011). They are one of the most significant incubators of ideas and solutions to global problems, and their central position amongst the networks of government, civil society, and industry partners, means that they have vast potential to generate positive impact.

The Bukidnon State University College of Education (BukSU-CoE) recognizes its primary role as knowledge producer and in creating a more sustainable future. Thus, the concept of education for sustainable development has become one of the core educational initiatives to help address the problems associated with human development. Education for sustainable development is embedded in the four-fold functions of the College, one of which is the conduct of the community extension projects. The CoE believed in its capability in contributing to the attainment of international, national, regional, local, and institutional development goals through extension programs and projects. The College also believed in rendering public service activities and engaging in resource generation projects that give emphasis on literacy that promotes better educational opportunities.

In 2019, there were four extension projects under the Continuing Professional Development through Extension Services (CPDES) program which started with the implementation phase. These projects were: Pedagogical Content Knowledge in Action (PCK), Capacitating DepEd Teachers on Knowledge and Skills in Sports (KSS), Capacitating the ALS InFed Teachers in Teaching Life-Skills Education (ALS InFed), and Empowering Child Development Workers' Classroom Management and Pedagogy (ECDW). These extension projects under CPDES were designed in response to the concerns and needs of the Department of Education to be updated with the pedagogy, instructional development, and research appropriate for the clientele in the K to 12 Program (College of Education Annual Extension Accomplishment Report, 2019).

The monitoring and evaluation of the CoE projects were deemed important to measure the effectiveness and relevance of the projects' activities. Evaluation is the systematic collection of information about activities, characteristics, and outcomes of projects to make judgments

about the project and improve effectiveness (adapted from Patton, 1987). Wideman (2020) stressed that project effectiveness is the extent to which the goals of a project are attained, or the degree to which the system can be expected to achieve a set specific requirement. In this study, project effectiveness focused on the following: attainment of learning outcomes, delivery and instructional materials, resource persons and trainers, and venues and facilities.

Learning outcomes are statements that describe the knowledge or skills that the beneficiaries of the projects should acquire by the end of a particular training. The modes of delivery are important when designing learning activities that will support the beneficiaries of the projects to develop the skills, knowledge, and understandings required to achieve the intended learning outcomes. The projects utilized trainings deemed as best suited to the participants.

The instructional materials support training content, allow participants of the training to engage in the application of concepts and provide an opportunity for evaluation. These materials were modules and pamphlets, which provided a wealth of knowledge in all the covered topics in the project trainings, offering in-depth information based on facts and skills. The resource persons and trainers are experts who contribute information, know-how, and the ones who demonstrated the skills to the participants in training. They were the extensionists in the CoE who were experts in their own respective fields. There were also invited resource persons from the partner Local Government Units of the CoE projects.

The venue and facility simply mean the place or places in which the training is conducted. The training venue is arguably as important as the training content itself. A great venue will ensure that the participants are engaged, comfortable, and in the right frame of mind for the learning and the development of skills. BukSU allowed its facilities such as the audio-visual center, the covered court, the gymnasium, etc., to be used in the various extension trainings.

All these areas were considered important in ensuring the effectiveness of the projects. Oakley and Garforth (1988) mentioned that the written statement of an extension program and project contains the following four elements: (1) Objectives which the agent expects to be achieved in the area within a specified period of time; (2) Means of achieving the objectives; (3) Resources that are needed to fulfill the program; and (4) Work plan or the schedule of extension activities that will lead to the fulfillment of the program/project. These four elements as present in the CoE extension project proposals were rigorously analyzed to determine whether the project had produced planned results, delivered expected benefits, and made desired change. More so, the study also aimed to generate data that allows for cumulative learning which, in turn, contributes to better designed projects and improved project management. The key words in this scenario are “lessons learned,” which may assist in the reformulation of objectives, policies, and strategies in projects.

Formal evaluations are systematic and use explicit criteria and evidence to make judgments about a program’s relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, and/or impacts (Horton, D. et al., 1993). Evaluation can and may take place across the lifecycle of a program or project, from initial design and piloting through to implementation and ongoing delivery as a mainstream program (NSW, 2014). Project relevance is the extent to which the objectives and design respond to beneficiaries’ global, country, and partner/institution needs, policies, and priorities, and continue to do so if circumstances change. The CoE projects’ relevance in accordance with BukSU Extension Unit’s (EU) framework, national, and international goals were evaluated. The relevance evaluation involved looking at differences and trade-offs between different priorities or needs, to assess the extent to which the projects’ activities can be or has been adapted to remain relevant.

Given BukSU’s agenda and priorities, the respective colleges in the university identified their priority projects that are relevant but not limited to their respective curricula grounding from the extension agenda. The extension priority areas are clustered into 6 (six) categories: (1) lifelong learning (2) culture, arts and tourism, (3) governance and management, (4) environmental management and disaster risk reduction, (5) health and well-being, and (6) livelihood development and technology. As mandated, the administration, faculty, and student extensionists are to be engaged in these extension priority areas to optimally participate in national transformation through the transfer of knowledge and technology. The determination of the relevance of the CoE’s extension projects was specifically based on lifelong learning. It encompassed all learning activity undertaken by the projects with the aim of improving knowledge, skills, and competences within a personal, civic, social and/or employment-related perspective of the beneficiaries.

An extension project is called sustainable when a continued utilization of its results can be assured after the completion of the project. It ensures transfer of what is learnt. The CoE extension projects provided trainings which allowed the enhancing skills that each participant needs to improve. The trainings levelled-up the participants’ knowledge and skills. The knowledge and skills that are learned purports to enlarge human interest on its own, must be sustainable. The knowledge that helps beyond the time and context of its learning is referred to as “transfer of learning.” Transfer of learning is considered the return of investment of the CoE extension projects, that will be found useful and applicable to the project beneficiaries in their professions, workplace, and in the community. More so, the extension projects should therefore do what they can to get sponsoring organizations to support the trainings beyond its formal end. In the case of BukSU extension projects, linkages and partnerships with private and public agencies were forged to support the trainings and activities.

While there are project impact studies conducted by the extensionists for the different projects, it is also necessary to have an in-depth evaluation of the activities

during their implementing phases to ensure that they are as effective and as relevant as they can be. There are evaluation forms filled out by the clientele in the conduct of the activities; however, a more thorough scrutiny of the documents submitted as annual reports of the projects have to be evaluated in a more extensive and wider understanding whether the activities worked or not to identify areas for improvement in enhancing project design and performance. Through this, the extensionists can be helped in realizing the goals of the projects more efficiently.

The existing researches on the CoE extension projects are on the impacts. No study was conducted on the processes, particularly on the areas of effectiveness, relevance, and sustainability. It is the intent of this study to focus on these processes that are deemed necessary in the success of the implementation of the projects.

Objectives

This evaluation research aims to:

1. Assess the effectiveness of the teacher education extension projects in terms of:
 - 1.1 Learning Outcomes;
 - 1.2 Delivery and Instructional Materials;
 - 1.3 Resource Persons/Trainers; and
 - 1.4 Venues and Facilities.
2. Ascertain the relevance of the extension projects to BukSU Framework, national and international goals.

3. Determine the level of sustainability of the extension projects.

II. METHODOLOGY

This evaluation research determined the level effectiveness, relevance, and sustainability of the extension projects of the CoE under (CPDES) Program during the year 2019, namely: Pedagogical Content Knowledge in Action; Capacitating DepEd Teachers on Knowledge and Skills in Sports; Capacitating the ALS InFed Teachers in Teaching Life-Skills Education; and Empowering Child Development Workers’ Classroom Management. It utilized the descriptive quantitative method of research using the researcher-made survey instrument containing the four areas under effectiveness namely: learning outcomes, delivery and instructional materials, resource persons and trainers, and venues and facilities, with eighteen (18) indicators; relevance with seven (7) indicators; and sustainability with nine (9) indicators. The survey instrument was validated by three experts for validity and reliability. The participants of the study comprised of the 118 teacher beneficiaries of the projects. They answered the survey through the online platform using Google Form, and through the hard copy of the survey instrument. The statistical mean and standard deviation were used in the treatment of the data.

Scoring Procedure

The following scoring was used in study:

Scale	Qualitative Description	Qualifying Statement
5	Strongly agree	The project is highly effective/ relevant/ sustainable
4	Agree	The project is effective/ relevant/ sustainable
3	Somewhat agree	The project is moderately effective/ relevant/ sustainable
2	Disagree	The project is less effective/ relevant/ sustainable
1	Strongly disagree	The project is not effective/ relevant/ sustainable

Ethical Considerations

The study conformed to the principles of ethics in conducting researches. First, it secures certification from the research ethics committee before its implementation. Second, it sought the approval from the authorities, especially from the administrators. Third, it invited the participants through an informed consent form where they indicated their acceptance and agreement to provide relevant information for this research.

The informed consent form will be sent thru email. The expected output from the participants, the amount of time required for participation, the expected risks and benefits, the fact that participation was discretionary, and participants could withdraw at any time with no negative repercussions, and the protection of confidentiality of their responses, were considered.

III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

Effectiveness of the Teacher Education Extension Projects

Table 1 reveals the level of effectiveness of the teacher education projects in terms of the learning outcomes. Generally, the participants *strongly agreed* that all the projects under study were *highly effective*. The results also indicate that the responses of beneficiaries were homogenous in the four projects.

For the project PCK, the indicator with the highest mean is on the sufficiency of the durations of the activities in delivering the content. Based on the training matrix, there were series of seminar- workshops and sessions in the deliveries of the contents. The trainers and extensionists conducted the parallel training sessions focusing on the three subject areas: Math, English, and Science. The participants joined the sessions according to their major field, or the subject they were handling. One topic per parallel session

was covered to allot enough time for lectures and the workshops.

Table 1
Effectiveness of the Teacher Education Extension Projects in Terms of Learning Outcomes

Indicators	PCK			ALS InFEd			ECDW			KSS		
	x	SD	QD	x	SD	QD	x	SD	QD	x	SD	QD
The durations of activities were sufficient to deliver the content.	4.29	0.49	StA	4.64	0.57	StA	4.44	0.63	StA	4.57	0.57	StA
The activities supported the learning objectives.	4.14	0.69	StA	4.76	0.44	StA	4.56	0.63	StA	4.64	0.56	StA
The designs of activities (e.g. learning activities) encouraged participation in the project.	4.00	1.00	StA	4.72	0.46	StA	4.52	0.63	StA	4.54	0.64	StA
The activities were aligned to the learning objectives.	4.00	1.00	StA	4.80	0.41	StA	4.56	0.63	StA	4.64	0.57	StA
The activities provided opportunities to practice and reinforce what were taught.	3.86	0.90	StA	4.84	0.37	StA	4.56	0.57	StA	4.69	0.61	StA
Overall	4.06	0.16	StA	4.75	0.08	StA	4.53	0.05	StA	4.61	0.06	StA

Carried out series of seminar-workshops such as basic digital lay outting, trainings flower arrangement, balloon arts, baking, food preservation, processing of different meat products, meal management, table setting and table skirting, among others. The project equipped the teacher participants with the aforementioned skills, which in turn enabled them to teach the same skills to their ALS students.

For the project ECDW, the indicators with the highest means were on the activities being aligned to support the learning objectives. The project aimed to capacitate the child development workers with the classroom management skills and with various teaching strategies. In achieving these, the activities in the trainings conducted include sessions on understanding young children’s behavior and management and development of instructional materials for teaching young learners.

As to the projects KSS and ALS InFEd, providing the beneficiaries the opportunities to practice what were taught has the highest mean among the indicators. For KSS, these projects during the conduct of the trainings, the trainers introduced or demonstrated the how to do coaching, officiating, organizing, and facilitating sporting activities. During also the training the participants were to do the return demonstration. This strategy used by the extensionists

reinforced the mastery of the skills in the participants, which capacitated them to be coaches and officials in the local, regional, and national sports competition.

Table 2 presents the effectiveness of the teacher education extension projects in terms of delivery and instructional materials. Generally, it can be gleaned that the beneficiaries of the project PCK *agreed* that this area was *effective*. However, for the projects ALS InFEd, ECDW, and KSS, the beneficiaries *strongly agreed* that this was *highly effective*. As indicated in the standard deviation, there is homogeneity in the responses of all the beneficiaries across the projects.

In particular, under the PCK, ALS InFEd, and the ECDW projects, the beneficiaries *strongly agreed* that the modes of the delivery of the activities helped them learn the information and skills, which got the highest rank is *highly effective*. They expressed that they gained learnings in enhancing their skills and knowledge through series of seminar-workshops under these projects. Thus, the activities presented approaches, and strategies delivered to the beneficiaries during the conduct of the training affiliated with the goals and objectives of the project to CoE. It also implied that the extensionists were skilled and exceedingly effective to the participants.

Table 2

Effectiveness of the Teacher Education Extension Projects in Terms of Delivery and Instructional Materials

Indicators	PCK			ALS InFed			ECDW			KSS		
	x	SD	QD	x	SD	QD	x	SD	QD	x	SD	QD
The modes of the delivery of the activities helped me to learn the information and skills.	4.29	0.76	StA	4.72	0.46	StA	4.59	0.49	StA	4.64	0.56	StA
The learning materials assisted my learning.	4.14	0.69	StA	4.72	0.46	StA	4.48	0.50	StA	4.75	0.52	StA
The technology equipment was working properly	4.14	0.69	StA	4.68	0.56	StA	4.41	0.68	StA	4.57	0.63	StA
Overall	4.19	0.09	StA	4.71	0.02	StA	4.53	0.05	StA	4.65	0.09	StA

In addition, the DepEd teachers in Malaybalay City Division as the beneficiaries of the project KSS *strongly agreed* that the trainers delivered the topic to them during the training were well-prepared with enough tools and instructional materials. This also means that this indicator is *highly effective* as it enhanced their knowledge and skills in the attainment of the objective of the project knowing that the university is well equipped with enough tools, equipment, and facilities.

Table 3 indicates the effectiveness of the Teacher Education extension projects in terms of resource persons and trainers. Overall, it was revealed that the four projects are *highly effective*, as the participants *strongly agreed* to the generally positive statements in the indicators. The standard deviation shows the similarities of the responses of the participants.

Table 3

Effectiveness of the Teacher Education Extension Projects in Terms of Resource Persons and Trainers

Indicators	PCK			ALS InFed			ECDW			KSS		
	x	SD	QD	x	SD	QD	x	SD	QD	x	SD	QD
The resource persons/trainers were knowledgeable about the content of the activities/training.	4.71	0.49	StA	4.88	0.33	StA	4.74	0.52	StA	4.64	0.56	StA
The resource persons/trainers were responsive to the questions and other needs.	4.57	0.79	StA	4.84	0.47	StA	4.67	0.54	StA	4.69	0.48	StA
The resource persons/trainers presented the content in an interesting manner.	4.57	0.79	StA	4.80	0.41	StA	4.67	0.47	StA	4.61	0.63	StA
The resource persons/trainers communicated the content well.	4.43	0.53	StA	4.72	0.61	StA	4.63	0.55	StA	4.64	0.56	StA
The resource persons/trainers were prepared during the conduct of the activities.	4.43	0.79	StA	4.80	0.41	StA	4.70	0.46	StA	4.71	0.53	StA
The resource persons/trainers encouraged a participatory and interactive learning environment.	4.43	0.79	StA	4.80	0.41	StA	4.59	0.49	StA	4.61	0.63	StA
Overall	4.52	0.11	StA	4.81	0.05	StA	4.67	0.05	StA	4.65	0.04	StA

The participants for the projects PCK, ALS InFed, and ECDW *strongly agreed* that the resource persons or trainers were knowledgeable about the content of the activities or the conducted training itself. Based on the approved proposals of these projects, the persons involved which included the extensionists/trainers, were experts or well-versed with the topics or activities stipulated in the projects' activity training designs. Further, the BukSU Extension Unit only approves a project provided that the activities are aligned or based on the field of expertise of the extensionists. Additionally, to guarantee that the objectives or outcomes are met, the EU requires partnerships with experts from various agencies to help in the implementation of the activities.

For the KSS specifically, the resource persons/trainers were generally skilled and prepared with the necessary equipment to use during the conduct of the activities. The trainers were expected not only to deliver the theories, but most importantly, to demonstrate the necessary skills in coaching and officiating sports to the participants.

Table 4 shows the effectiveness of the Teacher Education extension projects in terms of venue and facilities. Generally, findings revealed that the projects are *highly effective* in the aspects of venue and facilities; this is *strongly agreed* upon by the participants. Similarities in the responses was also evident as indicated by the standard deviation.

According to the participants, the venues for the projects PCK, ALS InFed, and ECDW were easy to find, as this indicator obtained the highest mean. The activities of these projects were mostly held in BukSU. It was also noted that most of the participants were graduates of this Institution. Aside from that, most of the participants were from Malaybalay City. BukSU is considered a landmark in the city.

As to KSS, the indicator with the highest mean was on suitability of the venue for learning. Since the activities were sports-related, the venues often were the covered court and the gymnasium. The venues adequately catered to the need for space and equipment for the activities.

Table 4

Effectiveness of the Teacher Education Extension Projects in Terms of Venue and Facilities

Indicators	PCK			ALS InFed			ECDW			KSS		
	x	SD	QD	x	SD	QD	x	SD	QD	x	SD	QD
The venues were easy to find.	4.71	0.49	StA	4.88	0.44	StA	4.48	0.50	StA	4.50	0.64	StA
The venues were suitable for learning.	4.43	0.53	StA	4.68	0.56	StA	4.44	0.50	StA	4.57	0.50	StA
The facilities were adequate for the activity needs.	4.29	0.49	StA	4.68	0.48	StA	4.44	0.50	StA	4.54	0.64	StA
Overall	4.48	0.21	StA	4.75	0.12	StA	4.45	0.54	StA	4.54	0.04	StA

Table 5 reveals the summary of the effectiveness of the teacher education extension projects in the four areas. In general, the projects PCK, ALS InFed, ECDW, and KSS were *highly effective*, as *strongly agreed* in the responses of the respondents. Among the areas, the resource persons/trainers got the highest mean, which implies that the projects have more than enough pool of experts in the

conduct of all the activities. Although, the learning outcomes obtained the lowest mean, it is still in the *highly effective* category. According to Rubio et al. (2016), location is important in setting up Community Extension Program. Event venues are locations where events are taking place. The extension educators, staff and participants may select the perfect venue to ensure safety of every individual.

Table 5

Summary on the Effectiveness of the Teacher Education Extension Projects

Indicators	x	SD	QD
Resource Persons/Trainers	4.66	0.12	StA
Venue and Facilities	4.56	0.14	StA
Delivery and Instructional Materials	4.51	0.23	StA
Learning Outcomes	4.49	0.30	StA
Overall	4.55	0.08	StA

On Relevance of the Teacher Education Extension Projects

Table 6 presents the relevance of the teacher education projects. Generally, the participants *strongly agreed* that the four projects are *highly relevant*. The indicator on relevance of the project to SDG 5 on gender equality obtained the highest mean for the project PCK. The modules of the project emphasized the importance of catering to the diverse interests and abilities of the learners. Moreover, the use of teaching approaches in consideration to the learners' multiple intelligences and the use of appropriate strategies were highlighted to help and empower all types of learners to learn at their highest potential (*PCK in Action Workbook for Science Teacher*).

For project ALS InFed, the project's relevance to the national goal of ensuring inclusive and quality education for

all and promoting lifelong learning, got the highest mean. True to promoting lifelong learning based on the approved proposal, the project aims to capacitate the ALS InFed teachers on the content delivery of lifelong skills through the series of conducted seminar-workshops. Moreover, the project is also relevant in accordance with SDG 5 on gender equality. The participants of the project were inclusive of men and women in the Division of Malaybalay.

As for ECDW, the project's goals and objectives in being relevant to the national goal on achieving gender equality and empowering all women and girls, obtained the highest mean. It was noted that the identified beneficiaries of the Project were 98% women child development workers who were empowered in improving their classroom.

Table 6
Relevance of the Teacher Education Extension Projects

Indicators	PCK			ALS InFed			ECDW			KSS		
	x	sd	QD	x	sd	QD	x	sd	QD	x	sd	QD
The project goals and objectives were relevant to the BukSU Extension Framework	4.43	0.53	StA	4.84	0.37	StA	4.44	0.57	StA	4.68	0.55	StA
The project goals and objectives were relevant to the SDG 1 on poverty alleviation.	4.14	0.69	StA	4.64	0.49	StA	4.22	0.63	StA	4.61	0.63	StA
The project goals and objectives were relevant to the national goal on ensuring inclusive and quality education for all and promoting lifelong learning.	4.29	0.49	StA	4.84	0.47	StA	4.33	0.61	StA	4.61	0.57	StA
The project goals and objectives were relevant to the SDG 5 on the gender equality.	4.57	0.53	StA	4.84	0.47	StA	4.37	0.67	StA	4.61	0.57	StA
The project goals and objectives were relevant to the national goal on achieving gender equality and empowering all women and girls.	4.43	0.53	StA	4.76	0.44	StA	4.44	0.68	StA	4.57	0.63	StA
The project goals and objectives were relevant to the SDG 4 on the delivery of quality education.	4.29	0.49	StA	4.80	0.41	StA	4.33	0.61	StA	4.57	0.63	StA
The project goals and objectives were relevant to the national goal on ending poverty in all its forms everywhere.	4.43	0.53	StA	4.72	0.46	StA	4.22	0.57	StA	4.54	0.69	StA
Overall	4.37	0.14	StA	4.77	0.07	StA	4.34	0.09	StA	4.60	0.04	StA

Management and pedagogical practices. Furthermore, as stipulated in the approved proposal of the project, the module contents integrated GAD concepts.

Specified in the KSS proposal, the project was designed to capacitate the teachers on the needed knowledge and skills in sports through the series of seminars and workshops. This statement is aligned with the BukSU

Extension Framework, particularly under the agenda and thrust on literacy projects.

Extension activities instituted by HEI's is considered as "service learning" according to Tumapon, (2016). The colleges and universities extend their services to help the government attain its goals and objectives; and develop extension programs with the purpose of serving those who

need assistance where they can acquire enabling skills and knowledge for life (Guiab et al, 2016). Moreover, community extension services respond not only to the needs of the underprivileged communities but to the vision-mission of the colleges and universities as well as the expectations to make education accessible to the poor (Gonzales & Maghamil, 2009). This was supported by Dotong and Laguador, (2015) they emphasized the role of Higher Education Institution’s in building a strong community with empowered residents.

Extension programs and projects must be responsive to the needs of the target clientele and must be supportive of the ten-point agenda of the government (Salazar, 2020). In addition, the rate of participation and the attendance in the extension program may be an indicator of life-long learning and the aspiration to improve their quality of life (Perkins & Long, 2002).

On Sustainability of the Teacher Education Extension Projects

Table 7 presents the sustainability of the four Teacher Education extension projects. The results revealed that in general, the projects ALS InFed, ECDW, and KSS were *highly sustainable*, as *strongly agreed* by the participants, while the project PCK, as *agreed* by the participants, was *sustainable*. It was also the project with the lowest overall mean.

Specifically for ALS InFed, the indicator with the highest mean was on the suitability of the modalities in the

conduct of the activities according to the needs of the beneficiaries. Prior to the planning of activities, the extensionists had a consultative meeting last January 2018 with the target beneficiaries. During the meeting, the skills to be included in the training sessions of the projects were initially identified. It was followed by a needs assessment survey to determine the skills the teachers lacked.

Based on the consultative meeting and assessment survey, the detailed action plan for the project and the training manuals and instructional materials were developed. Another indicator with the highest mean was on the approval of the school head in the continued participation of the beneficiaries in the project. This was assured by a Memorandum of Agreement signed by the Schools Division Superintendent of Malaybalay City as well as the Education Program Supervisor of ALS SPED.

For the projects PCK, ECDW and KSS, the indicator that obtained the highest mean was on the resource persons’ attendance to capability-building activities to improve their skills in the conduct of the extension projects. The extensionists and trainers attended seminars/trainings to further enhance their skills. As expressed, improving their skills is necessary not just in the conduct of extension activities, but for their professional growth as well, being teachers in a higher education institution. Additionally, for ALS InFed and ECDW, the school heads also expressed their explicit approval for the beneficiaries to continue participating in the activities during the duration of the projects, as stipulated in the MOA.

Table 7
Sustainability of the Teacher Education Extension Projects

Indicators	PCK			ALS InFed			ECDW			KSS		
	x	sd	QD	x	sd	QD	x	sd	QD	x	sd	QD
The resource persons/extensionists attend projects/capability-building activities to improve their skills in the conduct of the extension project.	4.14	0.90	A	4.68	0.48	StA	4.56	0.57	StA	4.64	0.49	StA
The modalities in the conduct of the activities were suited to the needs of the times.	4.00	0.82	A	4.56	0.58	StA	4.44	0.57	StA	4.54	0.64	StA
I increased my skills in performing my tasks and duties in my workplace.	4.00	0.58	A	4.76	0.52	StA	4.52	0.57	StA	4.54	0.64	StA
The modalities in the conduct of the activities were suited according to the needs of the beneficiaries.	4.00	0.58	A	4.80	0.41	StA	4.44	0.57	StA	4.54	0.64	StA
My school head/ office head has recognized my improved performance in the workplace.	3.86	0.69	A	4.64	0.49	StA	4.52	0.57	StA	4.43	0.69	StA
Transfer of learning and ROIs from among the beneficiaries are evident.	3.57	0.79	A	4.72	0.46	StA	4.22	0.74	StA	4.36	0.78	StA
Various support was provided by the institution and partner agencies to sustain the project (human resource, financial support, etc).	3.71	0.76	A	4.72	0.46	StA	4.30	0.66	StA	4.54	0.64	StA
The number of activities conducted were enough/sufficient for the project beneficiaries to learn the concepts taught.	3.71	0.76	A	4.60	0.71	StA	4.48	0.57	StA	4.50	0.64	StA
My school head/office head expresses his/her approval for me to continue participating in the project.	3.71	0.49	A	4.80	0.41	StA	4.56	0.57	StA	4.43	0.69	StA
Overall	3.86	0.19	A	4.70	0.09	StA	4.44	0.12	StA	4.52	0.08	StA

IV. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

From the glowing assessments of the teacher participants and recipients of the Community Extension, it can be amply concluded that all the four (4) CoE Extension Projects were highly successful in terms of the three (3) areas of effectiveness, relevance, and sustainability. The positive feedbacks and observed results exceeded initial expectations, achieving the goals and objectives of the University and the sustainable development agenda of the national government and international sustainable goals. The Extension Projects generally empowered the target beneficiaries to improve their lives through continuing education and training, developed skills and attitudes helpful in their work and profession, and provided an avenue for the dynamic and continuing transfer of knowledge, thereby promoting the overall quality of life among them.

All the CoE Extension Projects had been highly effective, relevant, practical, and helpful to the beneficiaries. The learning objectives are met. The resource speakers and experts in their field. The facilities are adequate. As observed, there was a level of dynamic and continuing transfer of what was learned from the university extensionists by the participating teachers, as the knowledge passed on to the latter's students and into the community at large. This constitutes sustainability in the form of dynamic knowledge transfer. The high level of success of the projects should therefore also provide the necessary impetus for the Extension Unit of the University and all the stakeholders to continue the projects and expand its scopes to address all the other relevant community issues and cater to a wider variety of audiences that needed its expertise.

However, as the Extension Projects were all done prior to the present Covid-19 pandemic, the future extension programs may be made to adapt to the new and distinctive realities of the present times. The project activities may be resilient and adopted to the needs of the times chiefly in terms of the modes of delivery. This means that a more modular approach to the training would be in place, limited face to face encounters may be adopted, highlighting the need for a more virtual and electronic platforms to be adopted, like zoom meetings, radio broadcasts, etc. The increased non-physical meetings may also increase the need for a more stringent monitoring and follow-up system to be enforced. Thus, regular monitoring would be enforced and incorporated within the Project's implementation.

On this regard, the University's Extension Unit may have to provide an all-out support to the CoE Projects in the future, especially at these "new normal" times where the services of the University will be more needed. All the stakeholders would be made ready and capacitated for the greater and bigger roles to play in the Community through its Extension Programs. The formulation of policies adapted to the times for future directions is highly recommended.

REFERENCES

- [1]. Aniedi, Archibong Ijeoma, David Otu Effiom. Research mandate of the University: An assessment of junior academic staff participation. *Journal of Education and Sociology*.2011;4:3-7. [ISSN:2078-032X]
- [2]. Patton, M.Q. (1987). *Qualitative Research Evaluation Methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publishers.
- [3]. Wideman, M. (2020). Managing the development of building projects for better results. Retrieved from www.maxwideman.com
- [4]. Oakley P. and C. Garforth. 1985. *Guide to Extension Training: 7. The planning and evaluation of extension programmes*
- [5]. Merriam, S. B. (1998). *Qualitative research and case study applications in education*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- [6]. Horton, D. et al (1993). *Monitoring and evaluating agricultural research: A sourcebook*. Wallingford: CAB International.
- [7]. Tumapon, T. (2017). Bracing up research with extension services.<http://www.manilatimes.net/bracing-research-extension-services/342337/>
- [8]. Guiab, M.R., Sario, M.P., & Guiab, R. R. (2016). Assessment of extension programs: A basis for a proposed strategic program of activities. *Scholars World - International Refereed Multidisciplinary Journal Of Contemporary Research*,4(3), 24-34. Retrieved from www.irmjcr.scholarsworld.net
- [9]. Salazar, T.B. (2020). An Impact Study of the Community Extension Programs in a State College in the Philippines. *Article in International Journal of Educational Sciences*. May 2020 DOI: 10.31901/24566322.2020/29.1-3.1129
- [10]. Perkins, D. D., & Long, D. A. (2002). Neighborhood sense of community and social capital: A multi-level analysis. In A. Fisher, C. Sonn, & B. Bishop (Eds.), *Psychological sense of community: Research, applications, and implications*. New York: Plenum (pp. 291-318).
- [11]. Rubio Jo-Anne May A, Pentinio CVP, Ascan JC, Mendoza MCD, Vito JV, Encio HA 2016. Involvement in community extension program of business administration students in one higher education institution in the Philippines. *Asia Pacific Journal of Multidisciplinary Research*, 4(1): 109-122
- [12]. Dotong, C. and Laguardor J. (2015). Developing and Maintaining an International Climate among Philippine Higher education Institutions <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/309041318>
- [13]. Gonzales, A.C. and Maghamil, C.W. (2009). Impact of Community Extension Program on LSU Faculty Guiab, M.R., Sario,M.P.,& Guiab,R.R.(2016). Assessment of extension programs: A basis for a proposed strategic program of activities.

- [14]. Avelar, A., Oliveira, K., & Pereira, R. (2019). Education for advancing the implementation of the sustainable development goals: a systematic approach. *The International Journal of Management Education*, 17(3). <https://bit.ly/3cTHrJl>
- [15]. Bizikova, L., Jungcurt, S., McDougal, K., and Tyler, S. (2020). How can agricultural interventions enhance contribution to food security and SDG 2.1? *Science Direct Journal*, 26, 1-8. <https://bit.ly/3c4rlxm>
- [16]. Onwuka, F., Otaokpukpu, J., & Okonkwo, C. (2017). Effectiveness of extension services in enhancing the productivity, income and welfare of women farmers cooperatives in Kajuru Local Government Area of Kaduna State. *IIARD International Journal of Economics and Business Management*, 3(8), 86-100. <https://bit.ly/2OXrI3T>
- [17]. Finatto, C., Gomes da Silva, C., Carpejani, G., Salgueirinho, J., & Osório de Andrade, G. (2020). *Women's empowerment initiatives in Brazilian universities: cases of extension programs to promote sustainable development. 5th World Symposium on Sustainable Development at Universities*. <https://bit.ly/310zmgv>
- [18]. Gall, M. D., Gall, J. P., & Borg, W. R. (2007). *Educational research: An introduction (8th ed)*. New York, NY: Pearson.
- [19]. Saravanan, R., & Veerabhadraiah, V. (2007). Effectiveness indicators of public, private, and NGOs, agricultural extension programs in Karnataka State, India. *Journal of Extension Systems*, 1-12. <https://bit.ly/312S1Ip>
- [20]. Stake, R. E. (1995). *The art of case study research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications.
- [21]. Tacbas, L. B., De Vera, M. P. & Romo, N. V. (2010). The effectiveness of the extension programs of the University of Northern Philippines school year 2005–2008 . *UNP Research Journal*, 19(1). <https://bit.ly/38YnX4X>
- [22]. Taher Azizi-Khalkheili, T., Bijani, M., Shahpasand, M., & Farbod, F. (2016). Effectiveness evaluation of rural extension education programs (the case of sheep breeders in Pasargad Township, Iran). *International Journal of Agricultural Management and Development (IJAMAD)*. <https://bit.ly/3cSn5QzS>
- [23]. Yazan, B. (2015). Three Approaches to Case Study Methods in Education: Yin, Merriam, and Stake. *The Qualitative Report*, 20(2), 134-152. <https://bit.ly/3cSPeaf>
- [24]. Yin, R. K. (2002). *Case study research: Design and methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications. https://www.oecd.org/dac/evaluation/daccriteria_for_evaluating_development
- [25]. <https://buksu.edu.ph/extension-unit/>